# Stability and Bifurcation in a Stage-structured Predator-prey Model with Allee Effect and Time Delay

Zaowang Xiao and Zhong Li\*

Abstract—In this paper, we study a stage-structured predator-prey model incorporating time delay with prey growth subject to a strong Allee effect. By analyzing the characteristic equation of the corresponding linearized system, we investigate the local asymptotic stability of the system according to the change of birth rate in prey. Using the delay as a bifurcation parameter, the model undergoes a Hopf bifurcation at the positive equilibrium when the delay crosses some critical values. On the other hand, we show that both predators and prey will go extinct if the birth rate is small or the Allee effect is large.

Index Terms—predator-prey, Allee effect, stage structure, stability, time delay.

#### I. INTRODUCTION

T HE Predator-prey model is one of the basic models in the theoretical studies of ecology. As we all know, predator-prey model has been studied extensively [1]-[8]. In order to explain the phenomena of predator species and prey species, many scholars investigated functional responses. For example, Chen, Xie, et al[9] and Chen, Wang, et al[10] studied the dynamic behaviors incorporating functional response for predator-prey model.

In modeling the predator-prey systems, a key factor in consideration is the Allee effect. The Allee effect named after Allee[11], has significant contribution to population dynamics. The Allee effect is a biological phenomenon, wherein positive correlation between population density and the average degree of individual fitness of the population or species [12], [13]. The Allee effects occur as a result of mate limitation, evading natural enemies, inbreeding depression, raising their young, and environmental conditioning [12], [14], [15]. In addition, the Allee effect has recently being studied by many scholars, see [16]-[21] and the references cited therein.

The Allee effect was shown that the low density population can affect the birth rate of the species [22], but the coefficients of the growth rate are irrelevant to the Allee-type function. Hence, let F(x) be the fertility rate of a species x [23]:

$$F(x) = \frac{ax}{A+x},$$

Manuscript received July 17, 2018; revised August 26, 2018. This work was supported the Foundation of Education Department of Fujian Province (JAT160063), the Natural Science Foundation of Fujian Province under Grant (2018J01664).

Zaowang Xiao is with the College of Mathematics and Computer Science, Fuzhou University, Fuzhou, Fujian, 350116 China (e-mail: za-owang1205@163.com).

Zhong Li (Corresponding author) is with the College of Mathematics and Computer Science, Fuzhou University, Fuzhou, Fujian, 350116 China (e-mail: liz@fzu.edu.cn). where a is the per capita maximum fertility rate of species x; A is the Allee effect constant of the species. If A > 0, the fertility rate of the species is zero if x = 0 and approaches to a if x is large enough. The value of the parameter A determines the growth rate of F(x). When A = 0, the fertility rate F(x) = a is density independent. Therefore when considering the Allee effect, the logistic equation can be rewritten in the following form

$$\dot{x} = x \left( \frac{ax}{A+x} - d - bx \right),\tag{1}$$

where d denotes the death rate of the species; the intraspecific competition intensity of the species is represented by b; ax/(A+x) is a Michaelis-Menten type function. Clearly, when A = 0, system (1) is reduced to the traditional logistic equation.

Zu[24] researched the following predator-prey system with Allee effect

$$\dot{x} = x \left(\frac{ax}{A+x} - d - bx\right) - mxy,$$
  
$$\dot{y} = nmxy - \delta y.$$
(2)

The authors investigated the existence and local stability of the equilibria of system (2). Also they studied the unstable or stable periodic fluctuations with the influence of Allee effect.

In most of ecosystems, maturation, pregnancy and hunting occur all the time. Hence, time delay due to gestation has been greatly researched as a focus issue in predator-prey system [25]-[31], since the current birth rate of the predator is related to its consumption of prey throughout the past history. For example, Chen, Xie, et al[32] discussed the partial survival and extinction of a delayed predator-prey model with stage structure. By applying the standard comparison theorem, some novel results concern with the extinction of the system and partial survival of the predator and prey species, respectively, are obtained.

As we all know, there are always many species going through two stages, immature and mature, which reflected the different characteristics of species at each stage. Therefore, stage structure population models are more reasonable than other models and exhibits real world phenomenon. In recent years, numerous papers have been considered the predatorprey system with stage structure, see [33]-[39] and the references cited therein. For example, Li, Han, et al[40] proposed a predator-prey system with stage structure and mutual interference. The authors study the global stability of the interior equilibrium of the system. Chen, Xie, et al[41] investigated a two-species May type cooperation model with stage structure. They obtained the global extinction, partial survival and global attractivity of the positive equilibrium. Wei and Fu[42] considered the dynamic behaviors of a predator-prey systems with Beddington-DeAngelis type functional response and stage structure for prey incorporating refuge.

However, still seldom scholars consider the stability of a stage-structured predator-prey model incorporating time delay with a strong Allee effect in prey. Hence, the main purpose of this paper is to study the stability and Hopf bifurcation of system (2) with stage structure. More precisely, we study the following model

$$\dot{x} = x \left( \frac{ax}{A+x} - d - bx \right) - mxy_2, \dot{y}_1 = nmx(t-\tau)y_2(t-\tau) - \delta y_1 - \beta y_1, \dot{y}_2 = \beta y_1 - ey_2,$$
(3)

where  $x, y_1$  and  $y_2$  denote the densities of prey species, immature predator species and mature predator species at time t, respectively; A, a, b, d, n, m,  $\beta$ ,  $\delta$ , e are positive constants;  $\tau$  demonstrates the time delay because of the gestation of the predator; m is the capture rate and n is the food conversion rate of predator;  $\eta$  is the conversion rate of nutrients into the production of predator species;  $\delta$  and e are the death rates of the immature and mature predator species.

The initial conditions for system (3) take the form

$$\begin{aligned} x(\theta) &= \phi(\theta), \quad y_1(\theta) = \psi_1(\theta), \quad y_2(\theta) = \psi_2(\theta), \\ \phi(\theta) &\ge 0, \quad \psi_1(\theta) \ge 0, \quad \psi_2(\theta) \ge 0, \quad \theta \in [-\tau, 0), \quad (4) \\ \phi(0) &> 0, \qquad \psi_1(0) > 0, \qquad \psi_2(0) > 0, \end{aligned}$$

where  $(\phi(\theta), \psi_1(\theta), \psi_2(\theta)) \in C([-\tau, 0], \mathbb{R}^3_+)$ , the Banach space of continuous functions mapping the interval  $[-\tau, 0]$  into  $\mathbb{R}^3_+$ , where  $\mathbb{R}^3_+ = \{(x_1, x_2, x_3) : x_i \ge 0, i = 1, 2, 3\}$ .

The rest of this paper is organized as follows: The boundedness and the existence of equilibriums of system (3) are derived in the next section. In Section 3, we study the local asymptotic stability and Hopf bifurcation of system (3). We end this paper with examples and a brief discussion.

#### II. BOUNDEDNESS, AND EXISTENCE OF EQUILIBRIA

In this section, we study the boundedness and the existence of equilibriums of system (3).

$$a_1 = Ab + d + 2\sqrt{Abd}$$

**Theorem 2.1.** [43] Let x(t) be a positive solution of system (1) with the initial value x(0) > 0.

(1) If 
$$a < a_1$$
, then  $\lim_{t \to a_1} x(t) = 0$ .

(2) If 
$$a \ge a_1$$
, then we obtain the following results:

(i) For 
$$0 < x(0) < x_2$$
,  $\lim_{t \to +\infty} x(t) = 0$ ;

(ii) For 
$$x_2 < x(0)$$
,  $\lim_{t \to +\infty} x(t) = x_1$ ,

where

$$x_1 = \frac{k + \sqrt{Q_1}}{2b}$$
 and  $x_2 = \frac{k - \sqrt{Q_1}}{2b}$ 

with  $k = a - (Ab + d), Q_1 = a^2 - 2(Ab + d)a + (Ab - d)^2$ .

In the following, we show that the positivity and boundedness of solution of system (3). **Lemma 2.1.** Every solution of system (3) with the initial condition (4) are positive and ultimately bounded for all  $t \ge 0$ .

**Proof.** It is obviously that every solution of model (3) with initial conditions (4) are positive for all  $t \ge 0$ . The result is a direct consequence of Nagumos theorem [44]. Let  $V(t) = nx(t-\tau) + y_1(t) + y_2(t)$ , calculating the derivative of V(t) with respect to t along the positive solution of system (3), we have

$$\begin{split} \dot{V}(t) &= n\dot{x}(t-\tau) + \dot{y}_{1}(t) + \dot{y}_{2}(t) \\ &= nx(t-\tau) \bigg( \frac{ax(t-\tau)}{A+x(t-\tau)} - d - bx(t-\tau) \bigg) \\ &- nmx(t-\tau)y_{2}(t-\tau) + nmx(t-\tau)y_{2}(t-\tau) \\ &- \delta y_{1}(t) - \beta y_{1}(t) + \beta y_{1}(t) - ey_{2}(t) \\ &= nx(t-\tau) \bigg( \frac{ax(t-\tau)}{A+x(t-\tau)} - d - bx(t-\tau) \bigg) \\ &- \delta y_{1}(t) - ey_{2}(t). \end{split}$$

For a small positive constant  $s \leq \min\{\delta, e\}$ ,

$$V + sV = (s - \delta)y_1 + (s - e)y_2 + nx(t - \tau)$$
  
 
$$\times \left(s + \frac{ax(t - \tau)}{A + x(t - \tau)} - d - bx(t - \tau)\right)$$
  
$$\leq nx(t - \tau)\left(s + \frac{ax(t - \tau)}{A + x(t - \tau)} - d - bx(t - \tau)\right).$$

By Theorem 2.1, there exist some positive constants B and T, such that  $\dot{V}(t) \leq B - sV(t)$  for all  $t \geq T$ . Thus  $\dot{V}(t) + sV(t) \leq B$ , that is  $V(t) \leq \left(V(0) - \frac{B}{s}\right)e^{-st} + \frac{B}{s}$ . Therefore, V(t) is ultimately bounded, that is, each solution  $z(t) = (x(t), y_1(t), y_2(t))$  of system (3) is ultimately bounded. The proof is complete.

Obviously, system (3) always has a trivial equilibrium  $E_0(0,0,0)$ . If  $a > a_1$ , then system (3) has two boundary equilibria  $E_1(x_1,0,0)$  and  $E_2(x_2,0,0)$ .

Further, if  $a > a_2$ , then model (3) has a coexistence equilibrium  $E^*(x^*, y_1^*, y_2^*)$ , where

$$x^{*} = \frac{e(\beta + \delta)}{nm\beta}, \ y_{1}^{*} = \frac{ey_{2}^{*}}{\beta}, \ y_{2}^{*} = \frac{ax^{*} - (A + x^{*})(d + bx^{*})}{m(A + x^{*})}$$
  
with  $a_{2} = Ab + d + \frac{Ad}{x^{*}} + bx^{*}.$   
Obviously,

$$a_2 = Ab + d + \frac{Ad}{x^*} + bx^* \ge Ab + d + 2\sqrt{Abd} = a_1,$$
(5)

where  $a_2 = a_1$  if and only if  $A = \frac{b(x^*)^2}{d}$ .

The above analysis can be summarized in Table I.

TABLE IEQUILIBRIA OF SYSTEM (3).

$0 < a < a_1$		$E_0$ exists
$a > a_1$		$E_0, E_1, E_2$ exist
$A \neq b(x^*)^2$	$a_1 < a \le a_2$	$E_0, E_1, E_2$ exist
$A \neq \frac{d}{d}$	$a > a_2$	$E_0, E_1, E_2, E^*$ exist
$A = \frac{b(x^*)^2}{d}$	$a > a_1$	$E_0, E_1, E_2, E^*$ exist

Define  $A_1 = \frac{a+d-2\sqrt{ad}}{b}, \quad A_2 = \frac{(a-d-bx^*)x^*}{bx^*+d}$  and  $x_0^* = \frac{\sqrt{d}(\sqrt{a}-\sqrt{d})}{b}$ . By simple computation, we have

$$A_1 - A_2 = \frac{[bx^* - \sqrt{d}(\sqrt{a} - \sqrt{d})]^2}{b(bx^* + d)}$$
  
 
$$\geq 0, \text{ for all } 0 < x^* < \frac{a - d}{b}$$

particularly  $A_1 = A_2$  if and only if  $x^* = x_0^*$ . According to the Table I and simple analysis, we get the existence of equilibria of system (3) with the change of the Allee effect (see Table II).

TABLE IIEQUILIBRIA OF SYSTEM (3).

$a \leq d$	A > 0		$E_0$ exists
	$x^* \ge \frac{a-d}{b}$	$0 < A < A_1$	$E_0, E_1, E_2$ exist
a > d	$m^* \neq m^* \neq a-d$	$A_2 \le A < A_1$	$E_0, E_1, E_2$ exist
<i>u</i> > <i>u</i>	$> a  x_0 \neq x  < \frac{b}{b}$	$0 < A < A_2$	$E_0, E_1, E_2, E^*$ exist
	$x^* = x_0^* < \tfrac{a-d}{b}$	$0 < A < A_1$	$E_0, E_1, E_2, E^*$ exist

Tables I and II show that if the birth rate a is relatively small or the Allee effect A is relatively large, then system (3) only has one trivial equilibrium  $E_0$ , that is the predators and prey will be extinct. If the birth rate a is relatively large or the Allee effect A is relatively small, then system (3) has a positive equilibrium  $E^*$ , which guarantees the coexistence of system (3).

#### III. LOCAL STABILITY AND HOPF BIFURCATION

A.  $E_0 = (0, 0, 0)$ 

**Theorem 3.1.** The equilibrium point  $E_0$  of system (3) is locally asymptotically stable.

**Proof.** The variational matrix of system (3) at the equilibrium point  $E_0$  is

$$V(E_0) = \begin{bmatrix} \lambda + d & 0 & 0\\ 0 & \lambda + (\beta + \delta) & 0\\ 0 & -\beta & \lambda + e \end{bmatrix}.$$

Clearly, the characteristic equation of the equilibrium point  $E_0$  always has three negative real roots:  $\lambda = -d$ ,  $\lambda = -(\beta + \delta)$ ,  $\lambda = -e$ . The proof is complete.

It follows from Theorem 2.1 that we have

**Theorem 3.2.** Assume that  $a < a_1$ , then  $E_0(0,0,0)$  of system (3) is globally asymptotically stable.

When  $a < a_1$ ,  $E_0$  is globally asymptotically stable, which implies that both predators and prey will become extinct when their population densities lie in the attraction region of  $E_0$ . In particular, if the population density of prey becomes low, then both prey and predators will extinct.

B.  $E_1 = (x_1, 0, 0)$ 

### Theorem 3.3.

(1) Assume that  $A \neq \frac{b(x^*)^2}{d}$  hold. (i) If  $a_1 < a < a_2$ , then  $E_1$  of system (3) is a locally

(i) If  $u_1 < u < u_2$ , then  $E_1$  of system (3) is a local asymptotically stable equilibrium point.

(ii) If  $a > a_2$ , then the equilibrium point  $E_1$  of system (3) is unstable.

(2) If 
$$A = \frac{b(x^*)^2}{d}$$
 and  $a > a_1$ , then  $E_1$  of system (3) is unstable.

**Proof.** The characteristic equation of the equilibrium point  $E_1$  is

$$\left(\lambda - \frac{2Aax_1 + ax_1^2}{(A + x_1)^2} + d + 2bx_1\right) \times [\lambda^2 + P_1\lambda + P_0 + Q_0e^{-\lambda\tau}] = 0,$$
(6)

where  $P_1 = \beta + \delta + e$ ,  $P_0 = e(\beta + \delta)$ ,  $Q_0 = -nm\beta x_1$ . First, let

$$F_1(\lambda) = \lambda - \frac{2Aax_1 + ax_1^2}{\left(A + x_1\right)^2} + d + 2bx_1 = 0.$$
(7)

Solving the equation (7), we have

$$\lambda_{1} = \frac{2Aax_{1} + ax_{1}^{2}}{(A + x_{1})^{2}} - d - 2bx_{1}$$

$$= -\frac{2}{(Ab + \sqrt{Q_{1}} + a - d)^{2}} \Big[ (a - d) Q_{1} \qquad (8)$$

$$+ (a^{2} - (Ab + 2d)a - Abd + d^{2}) \sqrt{Q_{1}} \Big].$$

Obviously,  $(a - d) Q_1 > 0$ . Further, we consider the following equation

$$f_1(a) = a^2 - (Ab + 2d)a - Abd + d^2.$$
 (9)

Since

$$f_1(a_1) = f_1(Ab + d + 2\sqrt{Abd}) = 2Abd + 2Ab\sqrt{Abd} > 0,$$

and the symmetry axis of  $f_1(a)$  is  $\overline{a} = \frac{Ab}{2} + d < a_1$ , the inequality  $f_1(a) > 0$  holds for all  $a > a_1$ . Therefore, we have  $\lambda_1 < 0$ , then Eq.(7) has only one negative real root. Next, we consider the following equation

$$F_2(\lambda) = \lambda^2 + P_1 \lambda + P_0 + Q_0 e^{-\lambda \tau}.$$
 (10)

By calculation,  $e(\beta + \delta) < nm\beta x_1$  is equivalent to  $a > a_2$ . Thus, if  $a > a_2$ , it is easy to show that, for  $\lambda$  real,  $F_2(0) = e(\beta + \delta) - nm\beta x_1 < 0$ ,  $\lim_{\lambda \to +\infty} F_2(\lambda) = +\infty$ . Hence,  $F_2(\lambda) = 0$  has at least one positive real root. Therefore, if  $a > a_2$ , the equilibrium  $E_1$  is unstable.

When  $\tau = 0$ , Eq.(10) turns to

$$\lambda^2 + P_1 \lambda + P_0 + Q_0 = 0. \tag{11}$$

If  $a_1 < a < a_2$ , then  $P_0 + Q_0 > 0$ . By the Routh-Hurwitz criterion, this implies that the boundary equilibrium  $E_1$  is locally asymptotically stable.

For  $\tau > 0$ , we investigate the existence of purely imaginary roots of (10). If  $i\omega_1(\omega_1 > 0)$  is a solution of (10) if and only if  $\omega_1$  satisfies

$$-\omega_1^2 + P_1\omega_1 i + P_0 + Q_0 \big(\cos(\tau\omega_1) - i\sin(\tau\omega_1)\big) = 0.$$

Separating the real and imaginary parts, we obtain

$$P_{1}\omega_{1} = Q_{0}\sin(\tau\omega_{1}), 
\omega_{1}^{2} - P_{0} = Q_{0}\cos(\tau\omega_{1}),$$
(12)

which implies

$$\omega_1^4 + (P_1^2 - 2P_0)\omega_1^2 + P_0^2 - Q_0^2 = 0.$$
 (13)

Note that if  $a < a_2$ , which yields

$$P_{1}^{2} - 2P_{0} = (\beta + \delta + e)^{2} - 2e(\beta + \delta)$$
  
=  $e^{2} + (\beta + \delta)^{2} > 0,$   
$$P_{0}^{2} - Q_{0}^{2} = [e(\beta + \delta) + nm\beta x_{1}]$$
  
 $\times [e(\beta + \delta) - nm\beta x_{1}] > 0.$ 

By Theorem 3.4.1 in [45], if  $a_1 < a < a_2$ , then all the roots of (10) have negative real parts for all  $\tau \ge 0$ , this implies that the boundary equilibrium  $E_1$  locally asymptotically stable for all  $\tau \ge 0$ . The proof is complete.

 $C. E_2 = (x_2, 0, 0)$ 

**Theorem 3.4.** Let  $a > a_1$ , then  $E_2$  of system (3) is unstable.

**Proof.** The characteristic equation of the equilibrium point  $E_2$  is

$$\begin{pmatrix} \lambda - \frac{2Aax_2 + ax_2^2}{\left(A + x_2\right)^2} + d + 2bx_2 \end{pmatrix} [\lambda^2 + (\beta + \delta + e)\lambda + e(\beta + \delta) - nm\beta x_2 e^{-\lambda\tau}] = 0.$$

$$(14)$$

Solving the following equation

$$G_1(\lambda) = \lambda - \frac{2Aax_2 + ax_2^2}{\left(A + x_2\right)^2} + d + 2bx_2 = 0, \qquad (15)$$

we have

$$\lambda = \frac{2Aax_2 + ax_2^2}{(A + x_2)^2} - d - 2bx_2$$
  
=  $-\frac{2}{(Ab + \sqrt{Q_1} + a - d)^2} \Big[ (a - d) Q_1 + (-a^2 + Aba + 2da + Abd - d^2) \sqrt{Q_1} \Big]$   
=  $-G_2(Q_1) \times \frac{2}{(Ab + \sqrt{Q_1} + a - d)^2},$  (16)

where

$$G_2(Q_1) = (a-d)Q_1 + (-a^2 + Aba + 2da + Abd - d^2) \times \sqrt{Q_1}.$$
(17)

Let  $\sqrt{Q_1} = t > 0$ . It follows from Eq.(17) that

$$g(t) = (a - d)t^{2} + \left(-a^{2} + Aba + 2da + Abd - d^{2}\right)t.$$
(18)

Let g(t) = 0, then

$$t_1 = 0$$
 and  $t_2 = \frac{a^2 - (Ab + 2d)a - Abd + d^2}{a - d} = \frac{f_1(a)}{a - d},$ 
(19)

where  $f_1(a)$  is defined by (9). Similar to the analysis of Theorem 3.3, we obtain  $f_1(a) > 0$ , thus  $t_2 = f_1(a)/(a - d) > 0$ .

Hence, if  $0 < t < t_2$ , then g(t) < 0; if  $t_2 \leq t$ , then  $g(t) \geq 0$ . That is, if  $0 < Q_1 < t_2^2$ , then  $G_2(Q_1) < 0$ ; if  $t_2^2 \leq Q_1$ , then  $G_2(Q_1) \geq 0$ . Clearly, the inequality  $t_2^2 \leq Q_1$  does not hold, due to  $Q_1 - t_2^2 = -\frac{4A^2b^2ad}{(a-d)^2} < 0$ , which is a contradiction. Thus  $\lambda > 0$ , which implies Eq.(14) has at least one positive root and  $E_2$  is unstable. The proof of the theorem is complete.

We summarize the results of Theorems 3.3 and 3.4 in Table III. On the other hand, by the analysis of section 2 and Theorems 3.3 and 3.4, we also obtain the local asymptotic stability of equilibria  $E_i$ , i = 0, 1, 2 (see Table IV).

TABLE III Equilibria  $E_i, i = 0, 1, 2$  of system (3).

$0 < a < a_1$		$E_0$ GAS; $E_1$ and $E_2$ do not exist
$A = \frac{b(x^*)^2}{d}$	$a > a_1$	$E_0$ LAS; $E_1$ unstable; $E_2$ unstable
$A \neq \frac{b(x^*)^2}{d}$	$a_1 < a < a_2$	$E_0$ LAS; $E_1$ LAS; $E_2$ unstable
	$a > a_2$	$E_0$ LAS; $E_1$ unstable; $E_2$ unstable

 $\begin{array}{l} \text{TABLE IV} \\ \text{Equilibria} \ E_i, i=0,1,2 \ \text{of system (3) with } a>d. \end{array}$ 

$x^* > a-d$	$A \neq \frac{b(x^*)^2}{d}$	$0 < A < A_1$	$E_{0,1}$ LAS; $E_2$ unstable
$x \geq b$	$A = \frac{b(x^*)^2}{d}$	$0 < A < A_1$	$E_0$ LAS; $E_{1,2}$ unstable
$x^* < \frac{a-d}{b}$	$(b(x^*)^2)$	$0 < A < A_2$	$E_0$ LAS; $E_{1,2}$ unstable
	$A \neq \frac{d}{d}$	$A_2 < A < A_1$	$E_{0,1}$ LAS; $E_2$ unstable
$x \neq x_0$	$A = \frac{b(x^*)^2}{d}$	$0 < A < A_1$	$E_0$ LAS; $E_{1,2}$ unstable
$x^* = x_0^*$	$0 < A < A_1$		$E_0$ LAS; $E_{1,2}$ unstable
	$A > A_1$		$E_0$ GAS; $E_{1,2}$ inexistent

D. 
$$E^* = (x^*, y_1^*, y_2^*)$$

The characteristic equation at  $E^*$  is

$$\lambda^{3} + p_{2}\lambda^{2} + p_{1}\lambda + p_{0} + (q_{1}\lambda + q_{0})e^{-\lambda\tau} = 0, \qquad (20)$$

where

$$p_{2} = \beta + \delta + e + bx^{*} - \frac{Aax^{*}}{(A + x^{*})^{2}},$$

$$p_{1} = (\beta + \delta) \left( bx^{*} - \frac{Aax^{*}}{(A + x^{*})^{2}} \right) + e \left( \beta + \delta + bx^{*} - \frac{Aax^{*}}{(A + x^{*})^{2}} \right),$$

$$p_{0} = e(\beta + \delta) \left( bx^{*} - \frac{Aax^{*}}{(A + x^{*})^{2}} \right),$$

$$q_{1} = -e(\beta + \delta),$$

$$q_{0} = -e(\beta + \delta) \left( d + 2bx^{*} - \frac{2Aax^{*} + ax^{*2}}{(A + x^{*})^{2}} \right).$$

When  $\tau = 0$ , Eq.(20) turns to

$$\lambda^3 + p_2 \lambda^2 + (p_1 + q_1)\lambda + p_0 + q_0 = 0.$$
 (21)

(18) If  $a < a_3 = \frac{b(A+x^*)^2}{A}$ , we can obtain

$$p_{2} = \beta + \delta + e + bx^{*} - \frac{Aax^{*}}{(A + x^{*})^{2}} > 0,$$
  

$$p_{1} + q_{1} = (\beta + \delta + e)(bx^{*} - \frac{Aax^{*}}{(A + x^{*})^{2}}) > 0,$$
  

$$p_{0} + q_{0} = e(\beta + \delta)my_{2}^{*} > 0.$$

Note that  $a_3 - a_2 = \frac{b(A+x^*)^2}{A} - (Ab + d + \frac{Ad}{x^*} + bx^*) = \frac{(A+x^*)(b(x^*)^2 - Ad)}{Ax^*}$ . Let  $A < \frac{b(x^*)^2}{d}$ , then  $a_3 > a_2$ . Accordingly, we see that if  $A < \frac{b(x^*)^2}{d}$ ,  $a_2 < a < a_3$  and  $p_2(p_1+q_1) > (p_0+q_0)$  hold, by the Routh-Hurwitz criterion, the positive equilibrium  $E^*$  is locally asymptotically stable.

For  $\tau > 0$ . If  $i\omega(\omega > 0)$  is a solution of (20) if and only if  $\omega$  satisfies  $-\omega^3 i - p_2 \omega^2 + p_1 \omega i + p_0 + (q_1 \omega i + q_0) (\cos(\tau \omega) - i \sin(\tau \omega)) = 0$ . Separating the real and imaginary parts, we have

$$\omega^3 - p_1 \omega = q_1 \omega \cos(\tau \omega) - q_0 \sin(\tau \omega),$$
  

$$p_2 \omega^2 - p_0 = q_1 \omega \sin(\tau \omega) + q_0 \cos(\tau \omega),$$
(22)

which implies

$$\omega^{6} + (p_{2}^{2} - 2p_{1})\omega^{4} + (p_{1}^{2} - 2p_{0}p_{2} - q_{1}^{2})\omega^{2} + p_{0}^{2} - q_{0}^{2} = 0,$$
(23)

where

$$\begin{split} p_2^2 - 2p_1 &= (\beta + \delta)^2 + e^2 + \left(bx^* - \frac{Aax^*}{(A + x^*)^2}\right)^2 > 0, \\ p_1^2 - 2p_0p_2 - q_1^2 &= [(\beta + \delta)^2 + e^2] \\ &\times \left(bx^* - \frac{Aax^*}{(A + x^*)^2}\right)^2 > 0, \\ p_0^2 - q_0^2 &= emy_2^*(\beta + \delta)(p_0 - q_0). \\ \text{Denote } a_4 &= \frac{(3bx^* + d)(A + x^*)^2}{x^*(3A + x^*)}. \end{split}$$

Then we have

$$p_0 - q_0 = \frac{e(\beta + \delta)x^*(3A + x^*)^2}{(A + x^*)^2}(a_4 - a).$$

Note that, let  $A < \frac{b(x^*)^2}{d}$ , we derive that

$$a_{3} - a_{4} = \frac{b(A + x^{*})^{2}}{A} - \frac{(3bx^{*} + d)(A + x^{*})^{2}}{x^{*}(3A + x^{*})}$$
  
=  $\frac{(A + x^{*})^{2}(bx^{*2} - Ad)}{x^{*}(3A + x^{*})}$   
> 0, (24)

and

$$a_{4} - a_{2} = \frac{(3bx^{*} + d)(A + x^{*})^{2}}{x^{*}(3A + x^{*})} - (Ab + d + \frac{Ad}{x^{*}} + bx^{*}) = \frac{2(A + x^{*})(bx^{*2} - Ad)}{x^{*}(3A + x^{*})} > 0.$$
(25)

Therefore, let  $A < \frac{b(x^*)^2}{d}$ , if  $a_2 < a \leq a_4$ , then  $p_0^2 - q_0^2 > 0$ . Thus if  $a_2 < a \leq a_4$  and  $p_2(p_1+q_1) > (p_0+q_0)$ , this implies that (20) has no positive real roots. Therefore, by Theorem 3.4.1 in [45], if  $A < \frac{b(x^*)^2}{d}$ ,  $a_2 < a \leq a_4$  and  $p_2(p_1 + q_1) > (p_0 + q_0)$  are satisfied, then all the roots of (20) have negative real parts for all  $\tau \geq 0$ . Hence the positive equilibrium  $E^* = (x^*, y_1^*, y_2^*)$  is locally asymptotically stable for all  $\tau \geq 0$ .

If  $a_4 < a < a_3$  holds, this implies that  $p_0^2 - q_0^2 < 0$ , then there exists a unique positive root  $\omega_0$  satisfying (23). From (22), we have

$$\cos(\tau\omega_0) = \frac{q_1\omega_0^4 + (p_2q_0 - p_1q_1)\omega_0^2 - p_0q_0}{q_1^2\omega_0^2 + q_0^2}.$$
 (26)

Denote

$$\tau_{0n} = \frac{1}{\omega_0} \arccos \frac{q_1 \omega_0^4 + (p_2 q_0 - p_1 q_1) \omega_0^2 - p_0 q_0}{q_1^2 \omega_0^2 + q_0^2} + \frac{2n\pi}{\omega_0}, \quad n = 0, 1, 2, \cdots.$$
(27)

By Theorem 3.4.1 in Kuang [45], we see that if  $p_0^2 - q_0^2 < 0$  hold, then  $E^*$  remains stable for  $\tau < \tau_0 := \tau_{00}$ .

We now claim that

$$\left\{\frac{d(\mathrm{Re}\lambda)}{d\tau}\right\}_{\tau=\tau_0} > 0.$$

This will show that there exists at least one eigenvalue with a positive real part for  $\tau > \tau_0$ . Moreover, the conditions for the existence of a Hopf bifurcation are then satisfied yielding a periodic solution. To this end, differentiating Eq.(20) with respect to  $\tau$ , it follows that

$$\left(\frac{\mathrm{d}\lambda}{\mathrm{d}\tau}\right)^{-1} = -\frac{3\lambda^2 + 2p_2\lambda + p_1}{\lambda(\lambda^3 + p_2\lambda^2 + p_1\lambda + p_0)} + \frac{q_1}{\lambda(q_1\lambda + q_0)} - \frac{\tau}{\lambda}.$$

Hence, a direct calculation shows that

$$\begin{split} & \operatorname{sgn} \left\{ \frac{d(\operatorname{Re}\lambda)}{d\tau} \right\}_{\lambda=i\omega_{0}} \\ & = \quad \operatorname{sgn} \left\{ \operatorname{Re} \left( \frac{\mathrm{d}\lambda}{\mathrm{d}\tau} \right)^{-1} \right\}_{\lambda=i\omega_{0}} \\ & = \quad \operatorname{sgn} \{ -\frac{(p_{1}-3\omega_{0}^{2})(\omega_{0}^{2}-p_{1})+2p_{2}(p_{0}-p_{2}\omega_{0}^{2})}{(\omega_{0}^{3}-p_{1}\omega_{0})^{2}+(p_{0}-p_{2}\omega_{0}^{2})^{2}} \\ & -\frac{q_{1}^{2}}{q_{1}^{2}\omega_{0}^{2}+q_{0}^{2}} \}. \end{split}$$

We derive from (22) that

$$(\omega_0^3 - p_1\omega_0)^2 + (p_0 - p_2\omega_0^2)^2 = q_1^2\omega_0^2 + q_0^2.$$

(24) Therefore, we have  $\operatorname{sgn}\left\{\frac{d(\operatorname{Re}\lambda)}{d\tau}\right\}_{\lambda=i\omega_0} = \left\{ \operatorname{sgn}\left\{\frac{3\omega_0^4 + 2(p_2^2 - 2p_1)\omega_0^2 + p_1^2 - 2p_0p_2 - q_1^2}{q_1^2\omega_0^2 + q_0^2}\right\} > 0. \right\}$ Thus, the transversal condition holds and a Hopf bifurcation

Thus, the transversal condition holds and a Hopf bifurcation occurs at  $\omega = \omega_0$ ,  $\tau = \tau_0$ . Now, let us summarize our results as follows:

**Theorem 3.5.** (1) If  $A \geq \frac{b(x^*)^2}{d}$ ,  $E^*$  of system (3) is unstable.

(2) Let  $A < \frac{b(x^*)^2}{d}$  and  $p_2(p_1 + q_1) > (p_0 + q_0)$  hold. (i) If  $a_2 < a \le a_4$ , then the positive equilibrium  $E^*$  of

(i) If  $a_2 < a \le a_4$ , then the positive equilibrium  $E^*$  of system (3) is locally asymptotically stable for all  $\tau \ge 0$ .

(ii) If  $a_4 < a < a_3$ , then there exists a  $\tau_0 > 0$  such that  $E^*$  is locally asymptotically stable when  $\tau \in [0, \tau_0)$ . Furthermore, system (3) undergoes a Hopf bifurcation at  $E^*$  when  $\tau = \tau_0$ .

#### IV. NUMERIC EXAMPLES

In system (3), let A = 0.1, b = 2,  $\beta = 0.5$ , and  $d = m = n = \delta = e = 1$ , then  $\frac{b(x^*)^2}{d} = 18$ ,  $a_1 = Ab + d + 2\sqrt{Abd} = 2.0944$ ,  $a_2 = Ab + d + \frac{Aa}{4} + bx^* = 7.2333$ ,  $a_3 = \frac{b(A+x^*)^2}{A} = 192.2$  and  $a_4 = \frac{(3bx^*+d)(A+x^*)^2}{x^*(3A+x^*)} = 18.4434$ . (i) If a = 2,  $\tau = 10$ . It is easy to show that  $a < a_1$ . By

(i) If a = 2,  $\tau = 10$ . It is easy to show that  $a < a_1$ . By Theorem 3.2,  $E_0(0,0,0)$  is globally asymptotically stable. A numerical simulation illustrates this fact (Fig. 1).

(ii) If a = 6,  $\tau = 10$ . It is easy to show that  $a_1 < a < a_2$ ,  $A \neq \frac{b(x^*)^2}{d}$ , and the predator-extinction equilibrium  $E_1 = (2.3683, 0, 0)$ . By Theorem 3.3,  $E_1$  is locally asymptotically stable. A numerical simulation illustrates this fact (Figs. 2, 3).

(iii) If a = 18,  $\tau = 10$ , then  $A < \frac{b(x^*)^2}{d}$ ,  $p_2(p_1 + q_1) = 107.9200 > 15.6290 = (p_0 + q_0)$ ,  $a_2 < a < a_4$ , and the positive equilibrium  $E^* = (3, 20.8387, 10.4194)$ . By Theorem 3.5,  $E^*$  is locally asymptotically stable. A numerical simulation illustrates this fact (Fig. 4).

(iv) If a = 21, then  $A < \frac{b(x^*)^2}{d}$ ,  $p_2(p_1 + q_1) = 104.8101 > 19.9839 = (p_0 + q_0)$ ,  $a_4 < a < a_3$ , and the

positive equilibrium  $E^* = (3, 26.6452, 13.3226)$ . Further, by calculation, we have  $\tau_0 = 2.0387$ . By Theorem 3.5, when  $\tau < \tau_0$ , then  $E^*$  is locally asymptotically stable (Fig. 5); When  $\tau > \tau_0$ , then the positive equilibrium  $E^*$  of model (3) is unstable, it yields a periodic solution (Fig. 6).



Fig. 1.  $a = 2, \tau = 10, E_0$  of System (3) is Globally Asymptotically Stable.



Fig. 2. a = 6,  $\tau = 10$ ,  $E^* = (3, 20.8387, 10.4194)$  of System (3) is Locally Asymptotically Stable.



Fig. 3. a = 6,  $\tau = 10$ ,  $E^* = (3, 20.8387, 10.4194)$  of System (3) with Different Initial Values is Locally Asymptotically Stable.

#### V. CONCLUSION

In this paper, we investigate the stability and Hopf bifurcation of a stage-structured predator-prey model incorporating time delay with prey growth subject to a strong Allee effect. According to the change of the birth rate a, we investigate the stability of the equilibria of system (3), and find birth rate plays an important role in the dynamic behaviors of system (3). Theorem 3.5 shows that the system (3) undergoes a Hopf bifurcation at the coexistence equilibrium. That is, if  $\tau < \tau_0$ , the positive equilibrium  $E^*$  is stable, but it can lose its stability and a Hopf bifurcation occurs at the



Fig. 4. a = 18,  $\tau = 10$ ,  $E^* = (3, 20.8387, 10.4194)$  of System (3) is Locally Asymptotically Stable.



Fig. 5.  $\tau = 1.8 < 2.0387 = \tau_0$ , a = 21,  $E^* = (3, 26.6452, 13.3226)$  of System (3) is Locally Asymptotically Stable, System (3) Undergoes a Hopf Bifurcation at  $E^*$  When  $\tau_0$ .

positive equilibrium of system (3) when the delay crosses the critical value  $\tau_0$ , further we show periodic solutions. When  $\tau = 0$ , then system (3) is reduced to nondelay system, and we give the stability of nondelay system in the Table V.

TABLE V Equilibria  $E_i, i=0,1,2$  and  $E^*$  of system (3) with au=0.

$0 < a < a_1$		$E_0$ GAS; $E_{1,2}$ , $E^*$ inexistent
$A > \frac{b(x^*)^2}{d}$	$a_1 < a < a_2$	$E_{0,1}$ LAS; $E_2$ unstable; $E^*$ inexistent
	$a > a_2$	$E_0$ LAS; $E_{1,2}$ , $E^*$ unstable
$A = \frac{b(x^*)^2}{d}$	$a > a_1$	$E_0$ LAS; $E_{1,2}$ , $E^*$ unstable
$A < \frac{b(x^*)^2}{d}, \\ p_2(p_1 + q_1) \\ > p_0 + q_0$	$a_1 < a < a_2$	$E_{0,1}$ LAS; $E_2$ unstable; $E^*$ inexistent
	$a_2 < a < a_3$	$E_0$ LAS; $E_{1,2}$ unstable; $E^*$ LAS
	$a > a_3$	$E_0$ LAS; $E_{1,2}$ , $E^*$ unstable

Table VI presents that the results of Theorems 3.1-3.5. When the initial density of prey and predators are not low, we show the results of Table VI in Fig. 7, Fig. 8 and Fig. 9. with the same initial values. With the increasing of birth rate, the stability of equilibriums of system (3) will be changed. For example, if the birth rate is large enough, the stability of prey and predators will be destroyed, and the system becomes oscillation.

#### REFERENCES

- C. L. Shi, X. Y. Chen and Y. Q. Wang, "Feedback control effect on the Lotka-Volterra prey-predator system with discrete delays," *Advances in Difference Equations*, vol. 2017, no. 1, pp. 373, Jul. 2017.
- [2] Z. Z. Ma, F. D. Chen, C. Q. Wu and W. L. Chen, "Dynamic behaviors of a Lotka-Volterra predator-prey model incorporating a prey refuge and predator mutual interference," *Applied Mathematics and Computation*, vol. 219, no. 15, pp. 7945-7953, Apr. 2013.



Fig. 6.  $\tau = 2.2 > 2.0387 = \tau_0$ , a = 21,  $E^* = (3, 26.6452, 13.3226)$  of System (3) is Unstable, System (3) Undergoes a Hopf Bifurcation at  $E^*$  When  $\tau_0$ .

TABLE VI System (3) with  $p_2(p_1+q_1)>p_0+q_0$  and  $A<\frac{b(x^*)^2}{d}.$ 

Birth rate a	Equilibria
$0 < a < a_1$	$E_0$ GAS; $E_{1,2}$ , $E^*$ does not exist
$a_1 < a < a_2$	$E_{0,1}$ LAS; $E_2$ unstable; $E^*$ does not exist
$a_2 < a \le a_4$	$E_0$ LAS; $E_{1,2}$ unstable; $E^*$ LAS
$a_4 < a < a_3$	$E_0$ LAS; $E_{1,2}$ unstable; $E^*$ exists a Hopf bifurcation

- [3] L. J. Chen and F. D. Chen, "Dynamic behaviors of the periodic predator-prey system with distributed time delays and impulsive effect," *Nonlinear Analysis: Real World Applications*, vol. 12, no. 4, pp. 2467-2473, Aug. 2011.
- [4] C. F. Wang and Y. H. Zhang, "An improved artificial bee colony algorithm for solving optimization problems," *IAENG International Journal of Computer Science*, vol. 43, no.3, pp. 336-343, 2016.
- [5] F. D. Chen, X. D. Xie, Z. S. Miao and L. Q. Pu, "Extinction in two species nonautonomous nonlinear competitive system," *Applied Mathematics and Computation*, vol. 274, pp. 119-124, Feb. 2016.
- [6] F. D. Chen, Z. Z. Ma and H. Y. Zhang, "Global asymptotical stability of the positive equilibrium of the Lotka-Volterra prey-predator model incorporating a constant number of prey refuges," *Nonlinear Analysis: Real World Applications*, vol. 13, no. 6, pp. 2790-2793, Dec. 2012.
- [7] Q. X. Lin, X. D. Xie, F. D. Chen and Q. F. Lin, "Dynamical analysis of a logistic model with impulsive Holling type-II harvesting," *Advances in Difference Equations*, vol. 2018, no.1, pp. 112, Mar. 2018.
- [8] L. Y. Yang, X. D. Xie, F. D. Chen and Y. L. Xue, "Permanence of the periodic predator-prey-mutualist system," *Advances in Difference Equations*, vol. 2015, no. 1, pp. 331, Oct. 2015.
- [9] F. D. Chen, X. D. Xie and Z. Li, "Partial survival and extinction of a delayed predator-prey model with stage structure," *Applied Mathematics* and Computation, vol. 219, no. 8, pp. 4157-4162, Dec. 2012.
- [10] F. D. Chen, H. N. Wang, Y. H. Lin and W. L. Chen, "Global stability of a stage-structured predator-prey system," *Applied Mathematics and Computation*, vol. 223, pp. 45-53, Oct. 2013.
- [11] W. C. Allee, Animal Aggregations: A Study in General Sociology. USA: University of Chicago Press, 1932.
- [12] A. M. Kramer, B. Dennis, A. Liebhold and J. M. Drake, "The evidence for Allee effects," *Population Ecology*, vol. 51, no. 3, pp. 341-354, Jul. 2009.
- [13] F. Courchamp, L. Berec and J. Gascoigne, Allee Effects in Ecology and Conservation. Britain: Oxford University Press, 2008.
- [14] P. A. Stephens and W. J. Sutherland, "Consequences of the Allee effect for behaviour, ecology and conservation," *Trends in Ecology and Evolution*, vol. 14, no. 10, pp. 401-405, Oct. 1999.
- [15] G. M. Luque, T. Giraud and F. Courchamp, "Allee effects in ants," *Journal of Animal Ecology*, vol. 82, pp. 956-965, May 2013.
  [16] J. F. Wang, J. P. Shi and J. J. Wei, "Predator-prey system with strong
- [16] J. F. Wang, J. P. Shi and J. J. Wei, "Predator-prey system with strong Allee effect in prey," *Journal of Mathematical Biology*, vol. 62, no. 3, pp. 291-331, Mar. 2011.
- [17] X. Y. Guan, Y. Liu and X. D. Xie, "Stability analysis of a Lotka-Volterra type predator-prey system with Allee effect on the predator species," *Communications in Mathematical Biology and Neuroscience*, vol. 2018, Article ID 9, 2018.
- [18] R. X. Wu, L. Li and Q. F. Lin, "A Holling type commensal sym-



Fig. 7. Dynamic Behavior of the Prey of System (3) with A = 0.1, b = 2,  $\beta = 0.5$ ,  $d = m = n = \delta = e = 1$  and  $\tau = 2.2$ , Respectively.



Fig. 8. Dynamic Behavior of the Immature Predator of System (3) with A = 0.1, b = 2,  $\beta = 0.5$ ,  $d = m = n = \delta = e = 1$  and  $\tau = 2.2$ , Respectively.

biosis model involving Allee effect," *Communications in Mathematical Biology and Neuroscience*, vol. 2018, Article ID 6, 2018.

- [19] Q. F. Lin, "Allee effect increasing the final density of the species subject to the Allee effect in a Lotka-Volterra commensal symbiosis model," *Advances in Difference Equations*, vol. 2018, no. 1, pp. 196, May 2018.
- [20] Q. F. Lin, "Stability analysis of a single species logistic model with Allee effect and feedback control," *Advances in Difference Equations*, vol. 2018, no. 1, pp. 190, May 2018.
- [21] B. G. Chen, "Dynamic behaviors of a commensal symbiosis model involving Allee effect and one party can not survive independently," *Advances in Difference Equations*, vol. 2018, no. 1, pp. 212, May 2018.
- [22] P. J. Pal, T. Saha, M. Sen and M. Banerjee, "A delayed predator-prey model with strong Allee effect in prey population growth," *Nonlinear Dynamics*, vol. 68, no. 1-2, pp. 23-42, Apr. 2012.
- [23] J. B. Ferdy and J. Molofsky, "Allee effect, spatial structure and species coexistence," *Journal of Theoretical Biology*, vol. 217, no. 4, pp. 413-424, Aug. 2002.
- [24] J. Zu, "Global qualitative analysis of a predator-prey system with Allee effect on the prey species," *Mathematics and Computers in Simulation*, vol. 94, no. 10, pp. 33-54, Aug. 2013.
- [25] Z. Li and M. X. He, "Hopf bifurcation in a delayed food-limited model with feedback control," *Nonlinear Dynamics*, vol. 76, no. 2, pp. 1215-1224, Apr. 2014.
- [26] F. D. Chen, Z. Li, X. X. Chen and J. Laitochová, "Dynamic behaviors of a delay differential equation model of plankton allelopathy," *Journal* of Computational and Applied Mathematics, vol. 206, no. 2, pp. 733-754, Sep. 2007.
- [27] Y. Z. Liao, "Dynamics of two-species harvesting model of almost periodic facultative mutualism with discrete and distributed delays," *Engineering Letters*, vol. 26, no.1, pp. 7-13, 2018.
- [28] Q. H. Zhang and G. Y. Wang, "On anti-periodic solutions for FCNNs with mixed delays and impulsive effects," *IAENG International Journal* of Computer Science, vol. 45, no.1, pp. 82-88, 2018.
- [29] Y. Q. Li, L. J. Xu and T. W. Zhang, "Dynamics of almost periodic mutualism model with time delays," *IAENG International Journal of Applied Mathematics*, vol. 48, no.2, pp. 168-176, 2018.
- [30] Y. M. Chen, "Periodic solution of a delayed, periodic logistic equation," *Applied Mathematics Letters*, vol. 16, no. 7, pp. 1047-1051, Oct. 2003.
- [31] F. D. Chen, X. X. Chen and S. Y. Huang, "Extinction of a two species non-autonomous competitive system with Beddington-DeAngelis func-



Fig. 9. Dynamic Behavior of the Mature Predator of System (3) with  $A = 0.1, b = 2, \beta = 0.5, d = m = n = \delta = e = 1$  and  $\tau = 2.2$ , Respectively.

tional response and the effect of toxic substances," *Open Mathematics*, vol. 14, no. 1, pp. 1157-1173, Dec. 2016.

- [32] F. D. Chen, X. D. Xie and Z. Li, "Partial survival and extinction of a delayed predator-prey model with stage structure," *Applied Mathematics* and Computation, vol. 219, no. 8, pp. 4157-4162, Dec. 2012.
- [33] K. Yang, Z. S. Miao, F. D. Chen and X. D. Xie, "Influence of single feedback control variable on an autonomous Holling-II type cooperative system," *Journal of Mathematical Analysis and Applications*, vol. 435, no.1, pp. 874-888, Mar. 2016.
- [34] T. T. Li, F. D. Chen and J. H. Chen, "Stability of a mutualism model in plant-pollinator system with stage-structure and the Beddington-DeAngelis functional response," *Journal of Nonlinear Functional Analysis*, vol. 2017, Article ID 50, 2017.
- [35] A. Sai and N. Kong, "Sparse grid interpolation of Ito stochastic models in epidemiology and systems biology," *IAENG International Journal of Applied Mathematics*, vol. 48, no.1, pp. 45-52, 2018.
- [36] L. L. Wang and P. L. Xie, "Permanence and extinction of delayed stage-structured predator-prey system on time scales," *Engineering Letters*, vol. 25, no.2, pp. 147-151, 2017.
- [37] Z. Li, M. A. Han and F. D. Chen, "Global stability of stage-structured predator-prey model with modified Leslie-Gower and Holling-type II schemes," *International Journal of Biomathematics*, vol. 05, no. 06, pp. 13, 2012.
- [38] F. D. Chen, X. D. Xie and X. F. Chen, "Dynamic behaviors of a stage-structured cooperation model," *Communications in Mathematical Biology and Neuroscience*, vol. 2015, Article ID 4, 2015.
- [39] Y. H. Lin, X. D. Xie, F. D. Chen and T. T. Li, "Convergences of a stage-structured predator-prey model with modified Leslie-Gower and Holling-type II schemes," *Advances in Difference Equations*, vol. 2016, no. 1, pp. 181, Jul. 2016.
- [40] Z. Li, M. A. Han and F. D. Chen, "Global stability of a predatorprey system with stage structure and mutual interference," *Discrete and Continuous Dynamical Systems-Series B*, vol. 19, no. 1, pp. 173-187, Jan. 2014.
- [41] F. D. Chen, X. D. Xie and X. F. Chen, "Dynamic behaviors of a stage-structured cooperation model," *Communications in Mathematical Biology and Neuroscience*, vol. 2015, Article ID 4, 2015.
- [42] F. Y. Wei and Q. Y. Fu, "Globally asymptotic stability of a predatorprey model with stage structure incorporating prey refuge," *International Journal of Biomathematics*, vol. 09, no. 04, pp. 1650058, 2016.
  [43] Z. W. Xiao, X. D. Xie and Y. L. Xue, "Stability and bifurcation in a
- [43] Z. W. Xiao, X. D. Xie and Y. L. Xue, "Stability and bifurcation in a Holling type II predator-prey model with Allee effect and time delay," *Advances in Difference Equations*, vol. 2018, pp. 288, 2018.
- [44] N. Nagumo, "Über die lage der integeralkueven gewönlicher differentialgleichunger," *Proceeding of the Physico-mathematical Society of Japan*, vol. 24, pp. 551-559, 1942.
- [45] Y. Kuang, Delay Differential Equations with Applications in Population Dynamics. New York: Academic Press, 1993.